### Real Analysis

#### Chapter 10. Metric Spaces: Three Fundamental Theorem 10.2. The Baire Category Theorem—Proofs of Theorems

<span id="page-0-0"></span>

# [Corollary 10.5](#page-8-0)





#### Theorem 10.2.A. The Baire Category Theorem.

Let  $X$  be a complete metric space.

- (i) Let  ${O_n}_{n-1}^{\infty}$  be a countable collection of open dense subsets of X. Then the intersection  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$  is also dense.
- <span id="page-2-0"></span>(ii) Let  ${F_n}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  be a countable collection of closed hollow subsets of X. Then the union  $\cup_{n=1}^{\infty} F_n$  also is hollow.

**Proof.** A set is dense if and only if its complement is hollow by Note 10.2.A. A set is open if and only if its complement is closed. Then by De Morgan's Identities, (i) and (ii) are equivalent, so it is sufficient to prove (i). Let  $x_0 \in X$  and let  $r_0 > 0$ . To show that  $\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$  is dense, we need to show that  $B(x_0, r_0)$  contains a point of  $\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$ .

#### Theorem 10.2.A. The Baire Category Theorem.

Let  $X$  be a complete metric space.

- (i) Let  ${O_n}_{n-1}^{\infty}$  be a countable collection of open dense subsets of X. Then the intersection  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$  is also dense.
- (ii) Let  ${F_n}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  be a countable collection of closed hollow subsets of X. Then the union  $\cup_{n=1}^{\infty} F_n$  also is hollow.

**Proof.** A set is dense if and only if its complement is hollow by Note 10.2.A. A set is open if and only if its complement is closed. Then by De Morgan's Identities, (i) and (ii) are equivalent, so it is sufficient to prove (i). Let  $x_0 \in X$  and let  $r_0 > 0$ . To show that  $\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$  is dense, we need to show that  $B(x_0, r_0)$  contains a point of  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$ .

Since  $\mathcal{O}_1$  is dense in X, then there is some  $x_1 \in B(x_0, r_0) \cap \mathcal{O}_1$ . Choose  $r_1$ where  $0 < r_1 < 1$  for which  $\overline{B}_1(x_1, r_1) \subseteq B(x_0, r_0) \cap \mathcal{O}_1$  (this can be done by Note 10.2.B); denote  $B_1 = B(x_1, r_1)$ .

#### Theorem 10.2.A. The Baire Category Theorem.

Let  $X$  be a complete metric space.

- (i) Let  ${O_n}_{n-1}^{\infty}$  be a countable collection of open dense subsets of X. Then the intersection  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$  is also dense.
- (ii) Let  ${F_n}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  be a countable collection of closed hollow subsets of X. Then the union  $\cup_{n=1}^{\infty} F_n$  also is hollow.

**Proof.** A set is dense if and only if its complement is hollow by Note 10.2.A. A set is open if and only if its complement is closed. Then by De Morgan's Identities, (i) and (ii) are equivalent, so it is sufficient to prove (i). Let  $x_0 \in X$  and let  $r_0 > 0$ . To show that  $\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$  is dense, we need to show that  $B(x_0, r_0)$  contains a point of  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$ .

Since  $\mathcal{O}_1$  is dense in X, then there is some  $x_1 \in B(x_0,r_0) \cap \mathcal{O}_1$ . Choose  $r_1$ where  $0 < r_1 < 1$  for which  $\overline{B}_1(x_1, r_1) \subseteq B(x_0, r_0) \cap \mathcal{O}_1$  (this can be done by Note 10.2.B); denote  $B_1 = B(x_1, r_1)$ .

### Theorem 10.2.A. The Baire Category Theorem (continued)

**Proof (continued).** We now inductively create a contracting sequence of closed balls, the intersection of which will give and element of  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty}\mathcal{O}_n$  in  $B(x_0, r_0)$ . Suppose  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and the descending collection of open balls  ${B_k}_{k=1}^n$  has been chosen with the property that for  $1 \leq k \leq n$ ,  $B_k$  has radius less than  $1/k$  and  $\overline{B}_k \subseteq \mathcal{O}_k$  (the base case if given by  $B_1$  above). The set  $B_n \cap \mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  is nonempty since  $\mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  is dense in X. Let  $x_{n+1}$  belong to the open set  $B(x_n, r_n) \cap \mathcal{O}_n$ . Choose  $r_{n+1}$  such that  $0 < r_{n+1} < 1/(n+1)$  for which  $\overline{B}_{n+1}(x_{n+1}, r_{n+1}) \subseteq B_n \cap \mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  (this can be done by Note 10.2.B); denote  $B_{n+1} = B(x_{n+1}, r_{n+1})$ . This inductively defines a contracting sequence of closed sets  $\{\overline{B}_n\}_{n=1}^\infty$  with the property that for each n,  $\overline{B}_n \subset \mathcal{O}_n$ . The metric space X is complete by hypothesis, so from the Cantor Intersection Theorem we have that  $\cap_{n=1}^\infty \overline{B}_n$  is nonempty.

### Theorem 10.2.A. The Baire Category Theorem (continued)

**Proof (continued).** We now inductively create a contracting sequence of closed balls, the intersection of which will give and element of  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty}\mathcal{O}_n$  in  $B(x_0, r_0)$ . Suppose  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and the descending collection of open balls  ${B_k}_{k=1}^n$  has been chosen with the property that for  $1 \leq k \leq n$ ,  $B_k$  has radius less than  $1/k$  and  $B_k \subseteq \mathcal{O}_k$  (the base case if given by  $B_1$  above). The set  $B_n \cap \mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  is nonempty since  $\mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  is dense in X. Let  $x_{n+1}$  belong to the open set  $B(x_n, r_n) \cap \mathcal{O}_n$ . Choose  $r_{n+1}$  such that  $0 < r_{n+1} < 1/(n+1)$  for which  $\overline{B}_{n+1}(x_{n+1}, r_{n+1}) \subseteq B_n \cap \mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  (this can be done by Note 10.2.B); denote  $B_{n+1} = B(x_{n+1}, r_{n+1})$ . This inductively defines a contracting sequence of closed sets  $\{\overline{B}_n\}_{n=1}^\infty$  with the property that for each n,  $\overline{B}_n \subseteq \mathcal{O}_n$ . The metric space X is complete by hypothesis, so from the Cantor Intersection Theorem we have that  $\cap_{n=1}^\infty \overline{B}_n$  is **nonempty.** Let  $x_*$  belong to this intersection. Then  $x_* \in \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$ . Since  $\overline{B}_1 \subset B(x_0, r_0) \cap \mathcal{O}_1$ , then we have  $x_* \in B(x_0, r_0)$  also. Open ball  $B(x_0, r_0)$ is an arbitrary open ball and we have that  $b(x_0, r_0)$  contains a point of  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$ , so that  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$  is dense, as claimed.

### Theorem 10.2.A. The Baire Category Theorem (continued)

**Proof (continued).** We now inductively create a contracting sequence of closed balls, the intersection of which will give and element of  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty}\mathcal{O}_n$  in  $B(x_0, r_0)$ . Suppose  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and the descending collection of open balls  ${B_k}_{k=1}^n$  has been chosen with the property that for  $1 \leq k \leq n$ ,  $B_k$  has radius less than  $1/k$  and  $B_k \subseteq \mathcal{O}_k$  (the base case if given by  $B_1$  above). The set  $B_n \cap \mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  is nonempty since  $\mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  is dense in X. Let  $x_{n+1}$  belong to the open set  $B(x_n, r_n) \cap \mathcal{O}_n$ . Choose  $r_{n+1}$  such that  $0 < r_{n+1} < 1/(n+1)$  for which  $\overline{B}_{n+1}(x_{n+1}, r_{n+1}) \subseteq B_n \cap \mathcal{O}_{n+1}$  (this can be done by Note 10.2.B); denote  $B_{n+1} = B(x_{n+1}, r_{n+1})$ . This inductively defines a contracting sequence of closed sets  $\{\overline{B}_n\}_{n=1}^\infty$  with the property that for each n,  $\overline{B}_n \subseteq \mathcal{O}_n$ . The metric space X is complete by hypothesis, so from the Cantor Intersection Theorem we have that  $\cap_{n=1}^\infty \overline{B}_n$  is nonempty. Let  $x_*$  belong to this intersection. Then  $x_* \in \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$ . Since  $\overline{B}_1 \subseteq B(x_0, r_0) \cap \mathcal{O}_1$ , then we have  $x_* \in B(x_0, r_0)$  also. Open ball  $B(x_0, r_0)$ is an arbitrary open ball and we have that  $b(x_0, r_0)$  contains a point of  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$ , so that  $\cap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{O}_n$  is dense, as claimed.

# **Corollary 10.5.** Let X be a complete metric space and  ${F_n}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  a countable collection of closed subsets of X. Then  $\cup_{n=1}^{\infty} \textup{bd}(F_n)$  is hollow.

<span id="page-8-0"></span>**Proof.** In Problem 10.15 it is to be shown that the boundary of any set is itself a closed set, and the boundary of a closed set  $E$  is hollow. Therefore, for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , bd $(F_n)$  is closed and hollow. Then by the Baire Category Theorem (Theorem 10.2.A),  $\cup_{n=1}^{\infty}$ bd $(F_n)$  is hollow, as claimed.

**Corollary 10.5.** Let X be a complete metric space and  ${F_n}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  a countable collection of closed subsets of X. Then  $\cup_{n=1}^{\infty} \textup{bd}(F_n)$  is hollow.

**Proof.** In Problem 10.15 it is to be shown that the boundary of any set is itself a closed set, and the boundary of a closed set  $E$  is hollow. Therefore, for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , bd $(F_n)$  is closed and hollow. Then by the Baire Category Theorem (Theorem 10.2.A),  $\cup_{n=1}^{\infty}$ bd $(F_n)$  is hollow, as claimed.

**Theorem 10.6.** Let  $\mathcal F$  be a family of continuous real-valued functions on a complete metric space X that is pointwise bounded in the sense that for each  $x \in X$ , there is a constant  $M_x$  for which  $|f(x)| \le M_x$  for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ . Then there is a nonempty open subset  $\mathcal O$  of X on which  $\mathcal F$  is uniformly bounded in the sense that there is a constant M for which  $|f| \leq M$  on  $\mathcal O$ for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ .

<span id="page-10-0"></span>**Proof.** For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , define  $E_n = \{x \in X \mid |f(x)| \leq n \text{ for all } f \in \mathcal{F}\}\.$ Then  $f^{-1}([-n, n])$  is closed for each function in  ${\mathcal F}$  since each such function is continuous (by Problem 9.36) and hence  $\mathcal{E}_n = \cap_{f \in \mathcal{F}} f^{-1}(-n, n])$  is closed. Since  $\mathcal F$  is pointwise bounded by hypothesis, then for each  $x \in X$  there is  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $|f(x)| \leq n$  for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ ; that is,  $x \in E_n$ . Hence, since x is an arbitrary element of X, we have  $X = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} E_n$ .

**Theorem 10.6.** Let  $\mathcal F$  be a family of continuous real-valued functions on a complete metric space X that is pointwise bounded in the sense that for each  $x \in X$ , there is a constant  $M_x$  for which  $|f(x)| \le M_x$  for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ . Then there is a nonempty open subset  $\mathcal O$  of X on which  $\mathcal F$  is uniformly bounded in the sense that there is a constant M for which  $|f| < M$  on  $\mathcal O$ for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ .

**Proof.** For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , define  $E_n = \{x \in X \mid |f(x)| \leq n \text{ for all } f \in \mathcal{F}\}\.$ Then  $f^{-1}([-n,n])$  is closed for each function in  ${\mathcal F}$  since each such function is continuous (by Problem 9.36) and hence  $\mathcal{E}_n = \cap_{f \in \mathcal{F}} f^{-1}(-n, n])$  is closed. Since  $\mathcal F$  is pointwise bounded by hypothesis, then for each  $x \in X$  there is  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $|f(x)| \leq n$  for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ ; that is,  $x \in E_n$ . Hence, since x is an arbitrary element of X, we have  $X=\cup_{n=1}^\infty E_n$ . Since X is a complete metric space by hypothesis, then by Corollary 10.4 (the "in particular" part) there is  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  for which  $E_n$ contains an open ball  $B(x, r)$  (that is, some  $E_n$  has nonempty interior). The claim now holds with open set  $\mathcal{O} = B(x, r)$  and bound  $M = n$ .

**Theorem 10.6.** Let  $\mathcal F$  be a family of continuous real-valued functions on a complete metric space X that is pointwise bounded in the sense that for each  $x \in X$ , there is a constant  $M_x$  for which  $|f(x)| \le M_x$  for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ . Then there is a nonempty open subset  $\mathcal O$  of X on which  $\mathcal F$  is uniformly bounded in the sense that there is a constant M for which  $|f| < M$  on  $\mathcal O$ for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ .

**Proof.** For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , define  $E_n = \{x \in X \mid |f(x)| \leq n \text{ for all } f \in \mathcal{F}\}\.$ Then  $f^{-1}([-n,n])$  is closed for each function in  ${\mathcal F}$  since each such function is continuous (by Problem 9.36) and hence  $\mathcal{E}_n = \cap_{f \in \mathcal{F}} f^{-1}(-n, n])$  is closed. Since  $\mathcal F$  is pointwise bounded by hypothesis, then for each  $x \in X$  there is  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $|f(x)| \leq n$  for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$ ; that is,  $x \in E_n$ . Hence, since x is an arbitrary element of X, we have  $X=\cup_{n=1}^\infty E_n.$  Since  $X$  is a complete metric space by hypothesis, then by Corollary 10.4 (the "in particular" part) there is  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  for which  $E_n$ contains an open ball  $B(x, r)$  (that is, some  $E_n$  has nonempty interior). The claim now holds with open set  $\mathcal{O} = B(x, r)$  and bound  $M = n$ .  $\mathbf{L}$ 

**Theorem 10.7.** Let X be a complete metric space and  $\{f_n\}$  a sequence of continuous real-valued functions on X that converges pointwise on X to the real-valued function f. Then there is a dense subset D of X for which  ${f_n}$  is equicontinuous at each point in D.

**Proof.** Let  $m, n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Define

 $E(m, n) = \{x \in X \mid |f_i(x) - f_k(x)| \leq 1/m \text{ for all } i, k \geq n\}.$ 

The mapping  $x \mapsto |f_i(x) - f_k(x)|$  is continuous, and  ${x \in X \mid |f_i(x) - f_k(x)| \le 1/m}$  is the inverse image of  $[-1/m, 1/m]$ under this mapping so that this set is closed (by Problem 9.36). Now  $E(m, n) = \bigcap_{i,k \geq n} \{x \in X \mid |f_i(x) - f_k(x)| \leq 1/m\}$  so  $E(m, n)$  is closed. Then by Corollary 10.5,  $\bigcup_{n,m\in\mathbb{N}}$ bd $(E(m,n))$  is hollow and, by Note 10.2.A,  $D = X \sim [\cup_{n,m \in \mathbb{N}} \text{bd}(E(m,n))]$  is dense in X. If  $n, m \in \mathbb{N}$  and point  $x \in D$  belongs to  $E(m, n)$ , then x belongs to the interior of  $E(m, n)$ because D contains all boundary points of  $E(m, n)$ .

<span id="page-13-0"></span>

**Theorem 10.7.** Let X be a complete metric space and  $\{f_n\}$  a sequence of continuous real-valued functions on X that converges pointwise on X to the real-valued function f. Then there is a dense subset D of X for which  ${f_n}$  is equicontinuous at each point in D.

**Proof.** Let  $m, n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Define

$$
E(m, n) = \{x \in X \mid |f_j(x) - f_k(x)| \leq 1/m \text{ for all } j, k \geq n\}.
$$

The mapping  $x \mapsto |f_i(x) - f_k(x)|$  is continuous, and  ${x \in X \mid |f_i(x) - f_k(x)| \le 1/m}$  is the inverse image of  $[-1/m, 1/m]$ under this mapping so that this set is closed (by Problem 9.36). Now  $E(m, n) = \bigcap_{i,k \geq n} \{x \in X \mid |f_i(x) - f_k(x)| \leq 1/m\}$  so  $E(m, n)$  is closed. Then by Corollary 10.5,  $\bigcup_{n,m\in\mathbb{N}}$ bd $(E(m,n))$  is hollow and, by Note 10.2.A,  $D = X \sim [\cup_{n,m \in \mathbb{N}} \text{bd}(E(m,n))]$  is dense in X. If  $n, m \in \mathbb{N}$  and point  $x \in D$  belongs to  $E(m, n)$ , then x belongs to the interior of  $E(m, n)$ because D contains all boundary points of  $E(m, n)$ .

# Theorem 10.7 (continued 1)

**Proof (continued).** We now show that  $\{f_n\}$  is equicontinuous at each point of D. Let  $x_0 \in D$  and let  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Choose  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  for which  $1/m < \varepsilon/4$ . Since  $\{f_n(x_0)\}\$  converges to to real number  $f(x_0)$ , then  ${f_n(x_0)}$  is Cauchy. Hence we can choose a natural number N for which

 $|f_i(x_0) - f_k(x_0)| \leq 1/m$  for all  $i, k \geq N$ . (9)

Therefore  $x_0 \in E(m, N)$ . Since, as observed above,  $x_0$  belongs to the interior of  $E(m, N)$ . Choose  $r > 0$  such that  $B(x_0, r) \subseteq E(m, N)$ ; that is,

$$
|f_j(x) - f_k(x)| \leq 1/m \text{ for all } j, k \geq N \text{ and for all } x \in B(x_0,r). \qquad (10)
$$

The function  $f_N$  is continuous at  $x_0$ . Therefore there is a  $\delta > 0$  with  $0 < \delta < r$  for which

$$
|f_N(x) - f_N(x)| < 1/m \text{ for all } x \in B(x_0, \delta). \tag{11}
$$

# Theorem 10.7 (continued 2)

**Proof (continued).** Notice that for all  $x \in X$  and  $i \in \mathbb{N}$  we have

$$
f_j(x) - f_j(x_0) = [f_j(x) - f_N(x)] + [f_N(x) - f_N(x_0)] + [f_N(x_0) - f_j(x_0)].
$$

We now have by the Triangle Inequality, (9), (10), (11), and the fact that  $1/m < \varepsilon/4$  that

$$
|f_j(x)-f_j(x_0)|\leq 3/m<(3/4)\varepsilon \text{ for all }j\geq N \text{ and for all }x\in B(x_0,\delta). \quad (12)
$$

The finite family of continuous functions  $\{f_j\}_{j=1}^{\mathcal{N}-1}$  is equicontinuous at  $x_0$ (we just choose the smallest of the associated  $\delta$ 's). Combining this fact with (12), we have that  $\{f_n\}$  is equicontinuous at  $x_0$ . Since  $x_0$  is an arbitrary point of D, then  $\{f_n\}$  is equicontinuous on D, as claimed. Since  ${f_n}$  converges pointwise to f by hypothesis, then by taking the limit as  $j \to \infty$  in (12), we have  $|f(x) - f(x_0)| < \varepsilon$  for all  $x \in B(x_0, \delta)$ . That is, f is continuous at  $x_0$ . Since  $x_0$  is an arbitrary point of D, then f is continuous on dense subset D, as claimed.

# Theorem 10.7 (continued 2)

**Proof (continued).** Notice that for all  $x \in X$  and  $i \in \mathbb{N}$  we have

$$
f_j(x) - f_j(x_0) = [f_j(x) - f_N(x)] + [f_N(x) - f_N(x_0)] + [f_N(x_0) - f_j(x_0)].
$$

We now have by the Triangle Inequality, (9), (10), (11), and the fact that  $1/m < \varepsilon/4$  that

$$
|f_j(x)-f_j(x_0)|\leq 3/m<(3/4)\varepsilon \text{ for all }j\geq N \text{ and for all }x\in B(x_0,\delta). \quad (12)
$$

<span id="page-17-0"></span>The finite family of continuous functions  $\{f_j\}_{j=1}^{\mathcal{N}-1}$  is equicontinuous at  $x_0$ (we just choose the smallest of the associated  $\delta$ 's). Combining this fact with (12), we have that  $\{f_n\}$  is equicontinuous at  $x_0$ . Since  $x_0$  is an arbitrary point of D, then  $\{f_n\}$  is equicontinuous on D, as claimed. Since  ${f_n}$  converges pointwise to f by hypothesis, then by taking the limit as  $j \to \infty$  in (12), we have  $|f(x) - f(x_0)| < \varepsilon$  for all  $x \in B(x_0, \delta)$ . That is, f is continuous at  $x_0$ . Since  $x_0$  is an arbitrary point of D, then f is continuous on dense subset D, as claimed.