### **Real Analysis**

#### Chapter 9. Metric Spaces: General Properties

## 9.2. Open Sets, Closed Sets, and Convergent Sequences—Proofs of Theorems





- Proposition 9.3
- 3 Proposition 9.4

#### Proposition 9.6

**Proof.** Set X is open trivially. Set  $\emptyset$  is open vacuously.

**Proof.** Set X is open trivially. Set  $\emptyset$  is open vacuously. If  $\{\mathcal{O}_{\alpha}\}_{\alpha \in A}$  is a collection of open sets, then for  $x \in \bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  we have  $x \in \mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  for any given  $\alpha' \in A$ , so there is r > 0 such that  $B(x, r) \subset \mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  since  $\mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  is open. Also,  $B(x, r) \subset \bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  so  $\bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  is open.

**Proof.** Set X is open trivially. Set  $\emptyset$  is open vacuously. If  $\{\mathcal{O}_{\alpha}\}_{\alpha \in A}$  is a collection of open sets, then for  $x \in \bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  we have  $x \in \mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  for any given  $\alpha' \in A$ , so there is r > 0 such that  $B(x, r) \subset \mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  since  $\mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  is open. Also,  $B(x, r) \subset \bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  so  $\bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  is open.

Given  $\mathcal{O}_1, \mathcal{O}_2$  open, if  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2 = \emptyset$  then  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  is open. If  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2 \neq \emptyset$  then for any  $x \in \mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  we have  $x \in \mathcal{O}_1$  and so there is  $r_1 > 0$  such that  $B(x, r_1) \subset \mathcal{O}_1$  and there is  $r_2 > 0$  such that  $B(x, r_2) \subset \mathcal{O}_2$ .

**Proof.** Set X is open trivially. Set  $\emptyset$  is open vacuously. If  $\{\mathcal{O}_{\alpha}\}_{\alpha \in A}$  is a collection of open sets, then for  $x \in \bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  we have  $x \in \mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  for any given  $\alpha' \in A$ , so there is r > 0 such that  $B(x, r) \subset \mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  since  $\mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  is open. Also,  $B(x, r) \subset \bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  so  $\bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  is open.

Given  $\mathcal{O}_1, \mathcal{O}_2$  open, if  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2 = \emptyset$  then  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  is open. If  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2 \neq \emptyset$ then for any  $x \in \mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  we have  $x \in \mathcal{O}_1$  and so there is  $r_1 > 0$  such that  $B(x, r_1) \subset \mathcal{O}_1$  and there is  $r_2 > 0$  such that  $B(x, r_2) \subset \mathcal{O}_2$ . With  $r = \min\{r_1, r_2\}$  we have  $B(x, r) \subset \mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  and so  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  is open.  $\Box$ 

**Proof.** Set X is open trivially. Set  $\emptyset$  is open vacuously. If  $\{\mathcal{O}_{\alpha}\}_{\alpha \in A}$  is a collection of open sets, then for  $x \in \bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  we have  $x \in \mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  for any given  $\alpha' \in A$ , so there is r > 0 such that  $B(x, r) \subset \mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  since  $\mathcal{O}_{\alpha'}$  is open. Also,  $B(x, r) \subset \bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  so  $\bigcup_{\alpha \in A} \mathcal{O}_{\alpha}$  is open.

Given  $\mathcal{O}_1, \mathcal{O}_2$  open, if  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2 = \emptyset$  then  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  is open. If  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2 \neq \emptyset$ then for any  $x \in \mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  we have  $x \in \mathcal{O}_1$  and so there is  $r_1 > 0$  such that  $B(x, r_1) \subset \mathcal{O}_1$  and there is  $r_2 > 0$  such that  $B(x, r_2) \subset \mathcal{O}_2$ . With  $r = \min\{r_1, r_2\}$  we have  $B(x, r) \subset \mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  and so  $\mathcal{O}_1 \cap \mathcal{O}_2$  is open.  $\Box$ 

### **Proposition 9.3**

**Proposition 9.3.** For *E* a subset of a metric space *X*, its closure  $\overline{E}$  is closed. Moreover,  $\overline{E}$  is the smallest closed subset of *X* containing *E* in the sense that if *F* is closed and  $E \subset F$  then  $\overline{E} \subset F$ .

**Proof.** Let x be a point of closure of  $\overline{E}$ . Consider a neighborhood  $U_x$  of x. Then (by the definition of "x is a point of closure of  $\overline{E}$ ") there is  $x' \in \overline{E} \cap U_x$ .

### **Proposition 9.3**

**Proposition 9.3.** For *E* a subset of a metric space *X*, its closure  $\overline{E}$  is closed. Moreover,  $\overline{E}$  is the smallest closed subset of *X* containing *E* in the sense that if *F* is closed and  $E \subset F$  then  $\overline{E} \subset F$ .

**Proof.** Let x be a point of closure of  $\overline{E}$ . Consider a neighborhood  $U_x$  of x. Then (by the definition of "x is a point of closure of  $\overline{E}$ ") there is  $x' \in \overline{E} \cap U_x$ . Since x' is a point of closure of E and  $U_x$  is a neighborhood of x' then (by the definition of "x' is a point of closure of E") there is a point  $x'' \in E \cap U_x$ . Therefore arbitrary neighborhood  $U_x$  of x contains a point of E and so  $x \in \overline{E}$ . So  $\overline{E}$  contains all its points of closure and hence  $\overline{E}$  is closed.

**Proposition 9.3.** For *E* a subset of a metric space *X*, its closure  $\overline{E}$  is closed. Moreover,  $\overline{E}$  is the smallest closed subset of *X* containing *E* in the sense that if *F* is closed and  $E \subset F$  then  $\overline{E} \subset F$ .

**Proof.** Let x be a point of closure of  $\overline{E}$ . Consider a neighborhood  $U_x$  of x. Then (by the definition of "x is a point of closure of  $\overline{E}$ ") there is  $x' \in \overline{E} \cap U_x$ . Since x' is a point of closure of E and  $U_x$  is a neighborhood of x' then (by the definition of "x' is a point of closure of E") there is a point  $x'' \in E \cap U_x$ . Therefore arbitrary neighborhood  $U_x$  of x contains a point of E and so  $x \in \overline{E}$ . So  $\overline{E}$  contains all its points of closure and hence  $\overline{E}$  is closed.

Now  $A \subset B$  implies  $\overline{A} \subset \overline{B}$  (every point of closure of A is a limit point of B by definition), so if F is closed and  $E \subset F$  then  $\overline{E} \subset \overline{F} = F$ .

**Proposition 9.3.** For *E* a subset of a metric space *X*, its closure  $\overline{E}$  is closed. Moreover,  $\overline{E}$  is the smallest closed subset of *X* containing *E* in the sense that if *F* is closed and  $E \subset F$  then  $\overline{E} \subset F$ .

**Proof.** Let x be a point of closure of  $\overline{E}$ . Consider a neighborhood  $U_x$  of x. Then (by the definition of "x is a point of closure of  $\overline{E}$ ") there is  $x' \in \overline{E} \cap U_x$ . Since x' is a point of closure of E and  $U_x$  is a neighborhood of x' then (by the definition of "x' is a point of closure of E") there is a point  $x'' \in E \cap U_x$ . Therefore arbitrary neighborhood  $U_x$  of x contains a point of E and so  $x \in \overline{E}$ . So  $\overline{E}$  contains all its points of closure and hence  $\overline{E}$  is closed.

Now  $A \subset B$  implies  $\overline{A} \subset \overline{B}$  (every point of closure of A is a limit point of B by definition), so if F is closed and  $E \subset F$  then  $\overline{E} \subset \overline{F} = F$ .

# **Proposition 9.4.** A subset of a metric space X is open if and only if its complement in X is closed.

**Proof.** Suppose *E* is open in *X*. Let *x* be a point of closure of  $X \setminus E$ . Then *x* cannot belong to *E* since this would imply that there is a neighborhood of *x* that is contained in *E* and thus is disjoint from  $X \setminus E$  (implying that *x* is *not* a point of closure of  $X \setminus E$ ). So  $x \in X \setminus E$  and  $X \setminus E$  is closed.

**Proposition 9.4.** A subset of a metric space X is open if and only if its complement in X is closed.

**Proof.** Suppose *E* is open in *X*. Let *x* be a point of closure of  $X \setminus E$ . Then *x* cannot belong to *E* since this would imply that there is a neighborhood of *x* that is contained in *E* and thus is disjoint from  $X \setminus E$  (implying that *x* is *not* a point of closure of  $X \setminus E$ ). So  $x \in X \setminus E$  and  $X \setminus E$  is closed.

Suppose  $X \setminus E$  is closed. Let  $x \in E$ . Then x is not a point of closure of  $X \setminus E$  (since  $X \setminus E$  contains all of its points of closure) so there is a neighborhood  $U_x$  of x that does not intersect  $X \setminus E$ ; that is,  $U_x \subset E$ . Then E is open ( $U_x$  contains a ball centered at x).

**Proposition 9.4.** A subset of a metric space X is open if and only if its complement in X is closed.

**Proof.** Suppose *E* is open in *X*. Let *x* be a point of closure of  $X \setminus E$ . Then *x* cannot belong to *E* since this would imply that there is a neighborhood of *x* that is contained in *E* and thus is disjoint from  $X \setminus E$  (implying that *x* is *not* a point of closure of  $X \setminus E$ ). So  $x \in X \setminus E$  and  $X \setminus E$  is closed.

Suppose  $X \setminus E$  is closed. Let  $x \in E$ . Then x is not a point of closure of  $X \setminus E$  (since  $X \setminus E$  contains all of its points of closure) so there is a neighborhood  $U_x$  of x that does not intersect  $X \setminus E$ ; that is,  $U_x \subset E$ . Then E is open ( $U_x$  contains a ball centered at x).

**Proof.** First, suppose  $x \in \overline{E}$ . For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  since  $B(x, 1/n) \cap E \neq \emptyset$  there is  $x_n \in B(x, 1/n) \cap E$ . The resulting sequence satisfies  $\{x_n\} \subset E$ .

**Proof.** First, suppose  $x \in \overline{E}$ . For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  since  $B(x, 1/n) \cap E \neq \emptyset$  there is  $x_n \in B(x, 1/n) \cap E$ . The resulting sequence satisfies  $\{x_n\} \subset E$ . For any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there is  $N \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $1/N < \varepsilon$ . Then  $\rho(x_n, x) < 1/n \le 1/N < \varepsilon$  for all  $n \ge N$ . So  $\{x_n\} \to x$ .

**Proof.** First, suppose  $x \in \overline{E}$ . For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  since  $B(x, 1/n) \cap E \neq \emptyset$ there is  $x_n \in B(x, 1/n) \cap E$ . The resulting sequence satisfies  $\{x_n\} \subset E$ . For any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there is  $N \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $1/N < \varepsilon$ . Then  $\rho(x_n, x) < 1/n \le 1/N < \varepsilon$  for all  $n \ge N$ . So  $\{x_n\} \to x$ .

Conversely, if a sequence in E converges to x, then every ball centered at x contains infinitely many terms of the sequence and therefore contains points in E. So  $x \in \overline{E}$ .

**Proof.** First, suppose  $x \in \overline{E}$ . For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  since  $B(x, 1/n) \cap E \neq \emptyset$ there is  $x_n \in B(x, 1/n) \cap E$ . The resulting sequence satisfies  $\{x_n\} \subset E$ . For any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there is  $N \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $1/N < \varepsilon$ . Then  $\rho(x_n, x) < 1/n \le 1/N < \varepsilon$  for all  $n \ge N$ . So  $\{x_n\} \to x$ .

Conversely, if a sequence in *E* converges to *x*, then every ball centered at *x* contains infinitely many terms of the sequence and therefore contains points in *E*. So  $x \in \overline{E}$ .